

The "Wait Just a Minute!" Idea Evaluator

© 2008, Jamie McKenzie

Summary of Idea/Proposal:

Underlying Assumption #1

Veracity
Rating

- Strong
- Dubious
- Untenable

Explanation for Veracity Rating:

Underlying Assumption #2

Veracity
Rating

- Strong
- Dubious
- Untenable

Explanation for Veracity Rating:

Underlying Assumption #3

Veracity
Rating

- Strong
- Dubious
- Untenable

Explanation for Veracity Rating:

Underlying Assumption #4

Veracity
Rating

- Strong
- Dubious
- Untenable

Explanation for Veracity Rating:

Underlying Assumption #5	Veracity Rating <input type="checkbox"/> Strong <input type="checkbox"/> Dubious <input type="checkbox"/> Untenable
Explanation for Veracity Rating:	
Underlying Assumption #6	Veracity Rating <input type="checkbox"/> Strong <input type="checkbox"/> Dubious <input type="checkbox"/> Untenable
Explanation for Veracity Rating:	
Evaluating the Evidence Presented	
	Yes/No
Is information presented to back up or substantiate the proposal or strategy?	
Is the source of the information or data reliable, unbiased and trustworthy?	
Is the information sufficient to make the case?	
What information is missing?	
Is there any way to challenge, debunk or triangulate?	
Evaluating the Logic of the Arguments/Strategies Presented	
	Yes/No
Does the proposal make sense? Does it seem well constructed and well thought out?	
Have the authors carefully assessed the pros and cons of all options available?	
Did their assessment include the kind of evidence and data mentioned above, or did the authors rely upon gut feelings, faith and personal preferences?	
How thoroughly did the authors ground their proposal in an analysis of what might happen (i.e., go right or go wrong)? Was this analysis based on what has happened in the past? How did they substantiate their predictions of what might happen? Did they pay enough attention to uncertainties? Did they indulge in wishful thinking? Did they cover all the bases?	
Did the authors approach the issue dispassionately? Were they free of bias and ideology? Did they anchor their judgments in reasonable standards to help assess value?	

© 2008, Jamie McKenzie – This form may be duplicated by teachers for use with students but may not otherwise be published or printed in any medium without explicit permission from the author, Jamie McKenzie to be reached at mckenzie@fno.org